## Both ways rational functions

Christian Choffrut ${ }^{1}$ and Bruno Guillon ${ }^{1,2}$
${ }^{1}$ IRIF - Université Paris-Diderot, Paris 7
${ }^{2}$ Dipartimento di Informatica - Università degli studi di Milano

$$
\text { July 25, } 2016
$$

## Transductions

## Definition

A transduction is a relation in $\Sigma^{*} \times \Delta^{*}$.

## Transductions

## Definition

 input and output alphabetsA transduction is a relation in $\Sigma^{*} \times \Delta^{*}$.

Examples

$$
R:=\left\{\left.(u, v)| | u\right|_{a}=|v|_{a}\right\}
$$

## Transductions

## Definition

input and output alphabets
A transduction is a relation in $\Sigma^{*} \times \Delta^{*}$.

Examples

$$
R:=\left\{\left.(u, v)| | u\right|_{a}=|v|_{a}\right\}
$$

$$
S:=\left\{\left.(u, v)| | u\right|_{a}=|v|_{a} \text { and }|u|_{b}=|v|_{b}\right\}
$$

## One-way transductions

- [-way1] transduction if accepted by a [-way1] [-tape2] automaton.


## One-way transductions

- [-way1] transduction if accepted by a [-way1] [-tape2] automaton.



## One-way transductions

- [-way1] transduction if accepted by a [-way1] [-tape2] automaton.
copy vowels and duplicate consonants



## One-way transductions

- [-way1] transduction if accepted by a [-way1] [-tape2] automaton.



## One-way transductions

- [-way1] transduction if accepted by a [-way1] [-tape2] automaton.
copy vowels and duplicate consonants



## One-way transductions

- [-way1] transduction if accepted by a [-way1] [-tape2] automaton.
copy vowels and duplicate consonants

| C | a | n | a | d | a |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\downarrow$ |  | $\downarrow$ | $\downarrow$ |  |  |
| C C | a | n n | a | d d | a |

## One-way transductions

- [-way1] transduction if accepted by a [-way1] [-tape2] automaton.
copy vowels and duplicate consonants



## One-way transductions

- [-way1] transduction if accepted by a [-way1] [-tape2] automaton.
copy vowels and duplicate consonants



## One-way transductions

- [-way1] transduction if accepted by a [-way1] [-tape2] automaton.
copy vowels and duplicate consonants


Theorem (Elgot \& Mezei)
[-way1] transductions $=$ rational relations (Rat)

## One-way transductions

- [-way1] transduction if accepted by a [-way1] [-tape2] automaton.
copy vowels and duplicate consonants


Theorem (Elgot \& Mezei)
[-way1] transductions $=$ rational relations (Rat)
closure of finite transductions under union, concatenation and Kleene star

## One-way transductions

- [-way1] transduction if accepted by a [-way1] [-tape2] automaton.
copy vowels and duplicate consonants


Theorem (Elgot \& Mezei)
[-way1] transductions $=$ rational relations (Rat)
closure of finite transductions under union, concatenation and Kleene star

$$
R:=\left\{\left.(u, v)| | u\right|_{a}=|v|_{a}\right\} \in \operatorname{Rat}
$$

## One-way transductions

- [-way1] transduction if accepted by a [-way1] [-tape2] automaton.
copy vowels and duplicate consonants


Theorem (Elgot \& Mezei)
[-way1] transductions $=$ rational relations (Rat)
closure of finite transductions under union, concatenation and Kleene star

$$
\begin{gathered}
R:=\left\{\left.(u, v)| | u\right|_{a}=|v|_{a}\right\} \in \operatorname{Rat} \\
S:=\left\{\left.(u, v)| | u\right|_{a}=|v|_{a} \text { and }|u|_{b}=|v|_{b}\right\} \notin \operatorname{Rat}
\end{gathered}
$$

## Examples

$\operatorname{Id}_{\Sigma}:=\left\{(u, u) \mid u \in \Sigma^{*}\right\}$


## Examples

$\operatorname{Id}_{\Sigma}:=\left\{(u, u) \mid u \in \Sigma^{*}\right\}$

c a n a d a
$\overline{\operatorname{ld}}_{\Sigma}:=\left\{(\bar{u}, u) \mid u \in \Sigma^{*}\right\}$
a
d
a
$n$
a
C

## Examples

$\operatorname{Id}_{\Sigma}:=\left\{(u, u) \mid u \in \Sigma^{*}\right\}$


## Examples

$\operatorname{Id}_{\Sigma}:=\left\{(u, u) \mid u \in \Sigma^{*}\right\}$

$\overline{\mathrm{d}}_{\Sigma}:=\left\{(\bar{u}, u) \mid u \in \Sigma^{*}\right\}$


## Examples

$\operatorname{Id}_{\Sigma}:=\left\{(u, u) \mid u \in \Sigma^{*}\right\}$

$\overline{\operatorname{ld}}_{\Sigma}:=\left\{(\bar{u}, u) \mid u \in \Sigma^{*}\right\}$


## Examples

$\operatorname{Id}_{\Sigma}:=\left\{(u, u) \mid u \in \Sigma^{*}\right\}$

$\overline{\mathrm{Id}_{\Sigma}}:=\left\{(\bar{u}, u) \mid u \in \Sigma^{*}\right\}$


## Examples

$\operatorname{Id}_{\Sigma}:=\left\{(u, u) \mid u \in \Sigma^{*}\right\}$

$\overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Sigma}:=\left\{(\bar{u}, u) \mid u \in \Sigma^{*}\right\}$


## Examples

$\operatorname{Id}_{\Sigma}:=\left\{(u, u) \mid u \in \Sigma^{*}\right\}$

$\overline{\mathrm{I}}_{\Sigma}:=\left\{(\bar{u}, u) \mid u \in \Sigma^{*}\right\}$


## The mirror operations

$$
\overline{\mathrm{d}}_{\Sigma}:=\left\{(\bar{u}, u) \mid u \in \Sigma^{*}\right\}
$$

Definition (Mirror)
The mirror of a relation $R \subseteq \Sigma^{*} \times \Delta^{*}$ is the relation:

$$
\overline{\operatorname{Id}}_{\Sigma} \circ R:=\{(u, v) \mid(\bar{u}, v) \in R\}
$$

## The mirror operations

$$
\overline{\operatorname{ld}}_{\Sigma}:=\left\{(\bar{u}, u) \mid u \in \Sigma^{*}\right\}
$$

Definition (Mirror)
The mirror of a relation $R \subseteq \Sigma^{*} \times \Delta^{*}$ is the relation:

$$
\overline{\operatorname{Id}}_{\Sigma} \circ R:=\{(u, v) \mid(\bar{u}, v) \in R\}
$$

Definition $(\overline{\mathrm{Id}} \Sigma \circ$ Rat $)$
$R$ is mirror rational if $\overline{\mathrm{I}} \Sigma \circ R \in$ Rat.

## About mirrors

Proposition
$\overline{\operatorname{Id}}_{\Sigma} \notin \operatorname{Rat} \quad$ and $\quad \mathrm{Id}_{\Sigma} \notin \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Sigma} \circ$ Rat

## About mirrors

Proposition
$\overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Sigma} \notin \operatorname{Rat} \quad$ and $\quad \mathrm{Id}_{\Sigma} \notin \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Sigma} \circ$ Rat
Proposition

$$
R \in \text { Rat }
$$

$$
\overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Sigma} \circ R \circ \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Delta} \in \operatorname{Rat}
$$



## About mirrors

Proposition
$\overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Sigma} \notin \operatorname{Rat} \quad$ and $\quad \mathrm{Id}_{\Sigma} \notin \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Sigma} \circ$ Rat
Proposition

$$
R \in \text { Rat }
$$

$$
\overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Sigma} \circ R \circ \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Delta} \in \operatorname{Rat}
$$



## Both ways rational relations



## Both ways rational relations



## Both ways rational relations



Both ways rational relations


Both ways rational relations


## Examples of both ways rational relations



## Examples of both ways rational relations



## Examples of both ways rational relations



## Examples of both ways rational relations



## Examples of both ways rational relations



## Examples of both ways rational relations



## Examples of both ways rational relations



## Examples of both ways rational relations



## Examples of both ways rational relations



## Examples of both ways rational relations



## Examples of both ways rational relations



## Examples of both ways rational relations



## Examples of both ways rational relations



## Examples of both ways rational relations



## Examples of both ways rational relations



## Examples of both ways rational relations



## Examples of both ways rational relations



## Examples of both ways rational relations



## Factorizable relations

Definition (Fact)
$\mathrm{R} \subseteq \Sigma^{*} \times \Delta^{*}$ is factorizable if there exist

- $S \subseteq \Sigma^{*} \times a^{*}$ rational such that $R=S \circ T$.
- $\mathrm{T} \subseteq a^{*} \times \Delta^{*}$ rational

bwRat versus Fact
Proposition (closure properties)
If $R$ and $S$ belongs to Fact (resp. bwRat), then so do:
$-R \cup S \rightarrow R \circ S \rightarrow R^{-1} \bullet \overline{\mathrm{I}}_{\Sigma} \circ R \rightarrow R \circ \overline{\mathrm{I}}_{\Delta}$
bwRat versus Fact
Proposition (closure properties)
If $R$ and $S$ belongs to Fact (resp. bwRat), then so do:
$-R \cup S \bullet R \circ S \bullet R^{-1} \bullet \overline{I d}_{\Sigma} \circ R \bullet R \circ \overline{I d}_{\Delta}$
- $R \cdot T \vee R \cap T \quad$ for $T \in \operatorname{Rec}$


## bwRat versus Fact

Proposition (closure properties)
If $R$ and $S$ belongs to Fact (resp. bwRat), then so do:
$-R \cup S \bullet R \circ S \bullet R^{-1} \bullet \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Sigma} \circ R \vee R \circ \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Delta}$
$\checkmark R \cdot T \vee R \cap T \quad$ for $T \in \operatorname{Rec} \quad\left(T=\underset{\text { finite } \downarrow}{\bigcup} X_{i} \times \quad Y_{i}\right)$

## bu Rat versus Fact

Proposition (closure properties)
If $R$ and $S$ belongs to Fact (resp. bwRat), then so do:
$-R \cup S \bullet R \circ S \bullet R^{-1} \bullet \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Sigma} \circ R \vee R \circ \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Delta}$
$\triangleright R \cdot T \quad R \cap T \quad$ for $T \in \operatorname{Rec} \quad\left(T=\underset{\text { finite }}{\bigcup} X_{i} \times Y_{i}\right)$
Remark

$$
\in \operatorname{Rec}\left(\Sigma^{*}\right) \quad \in \operatorname{Rec}\left(\Delta^{*}\right)
$$

- $|\Sigma|=1 \Rightarrow$ Rat $=$ Fact = bwRat.
$-|\Delta|=1 \Rightarrow$ Rat $=$ Fact $=$ bwRat.


## bwRat versus Fact

Proposition (closure properties)
If $R$ and $S$ belongs to Fact (resp. bwRat), then so do:
$-R \cup S \bullet R \circ S \bullet R^{-1} \bullet \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Sigma} \circ R \vee R \circ \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Delta}$
$จ R \cdot T \quad R \cap T \quad$ for $T \in \operatorname{Rec} \quad\left(T=\bigcup_{\text {finite }} X_{i} \times Y_{i}\right)$

Remark

- $|\Sigma|=1 \Rightarrow$ Rat $=$ Fact = bwRat.
- $|\Delta|=1 \Rightarrow$ Rat $=$ Fact $=$ bwRat.
$\in \operatorname{Rec}\left(\Sigma^{*}\right) \quad \in \operatorname{Rec}\left(\Delta^{*}\right)$
Corollary
- Fact $\subseteq$ bwRat


## bwRat versus Fact

Proposition (closure properties)
If $R$ and $S$ belongs to Fact (resp. bwRat), then so do:
$-R \cup S \bullet R \circ S \bullet R^{-1} \bullet \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Sigma} \circ R \vee R \circ \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Delta}$
$จ R \cdot T \quad R \cap T \quad$ for $T \in \operatorname{Rec} \quad\left(T=\bigcup_{\text {finite }} X_{i} \times Y_{i}\right)$

Remark

- $|\Sigma|=1 \Rightarrow$ Rat $=$ Fact $=$ bwRat.
$-|\Delta|=1 \Rightarrow$ Rat $=$ Fact $=$ bwRat.

Corollary

- Fact $\subseteq$ bwRat

Question
Do we have Fact = bwRat?

## bwRat versus Fact

Proposition (closure properties)
If $R$ and $S$ belongs to Fact (resp. bwRat), then so do:
$-R \cup S \bullet R \circ S \bullet R^{-1} \bullet \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Sigma} \circ R \vee R \circ \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Delta}$

- R.T $\neg R \cap T \quad$ for $T \in \operatorname{Rec} \quad\left(T=\bigcup_{\text {finite }} X_{i} \times Y_{i}\right)$

Remark

- $|\Sigma|=1 \Rightarrow$ Rat $=$ Fact = bwRat.
$-|\Delta|=1 \Rightarrow$ Rat $=$ Fact $=$ bwRat.

Corollary

- Fact $\subseteq$ bwRat

Question
Do we have Fact = bwRat? No.

## bwRat versus Fact

Proposition (closure properties)
If $R$ and $S$ belongs to Fact (resp. bwRat), then so do:
$-R \cup S \bullet R \circ S \bullet R^{-1} \bullet \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Sigma} \circ R \vee R \circ \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Delta}$
$\bullet R \cdot T \vee R \cap T \quad$ for $T \in \operatorname{Rec} \quad\left(T=\bigcup_{\text {finite }} X_{i} \times Y_{i}\right)$

Remark
$-|\Sigma|=1 \Rightarrow$ Rat $=$ Fact = bwRat.
$-|\Delta|=1 \Rightarrow$ Rat $=$ Fact = bwRat.
$-|\Sigma|=1 \Rightarrow$ Rat $=$ Fact = bwRat.
$-|\Delta|=1 \Rightarrow$ Rat $=$ Fact = bwRat.

Corollary

- Fact $\subseteq$ bwRat

Question
Do we have Fact = bwRat? No.
Theorem
If $R$ is a rational (partial) function then:

$$
R \in \text { bwRat } \quad \Leftrightarrow \quad R \in \text { Fact }
$$

## bwRat versus Fact

Proposition (closure properties)
If $R$ and $S$ belongs to Fact (resp. bwRat), then so do:
$-R \cup S \bullet R \circ S \bullet R^{-1} \bullet \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Sigma} \circ R \vee R \circ \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Delta}$
-R.T $\neg R \cap T \quad$ for $T \in \operatorname{Rec} \quad\left(T=\bigcup_{\text {finite }} X_{i} \times Y_{i}\right)$
Remark

- $|\Sigma|=1 \Rightarrow$ Rat $=$ Fact = bwRat. $\in \operatorname{Rec}\left(\Sigma^{*}\right) \quad \in \operatorname{Rec}\left(\Delta^{*}\right)$
$\rightarrow|\Delta|=1 \Rightarrow$ Rat $=$ Fact = bwRat.
Corollary
- Fact $\subseteq$ bwRat


## Question

Do we have Fact = bwRat?

## No.

Theorem
If $R$ is a rational (partial) function then:

$$
R \in \text { bwRat } \quad \Leftrightarrow \quad R \in \text { Fact } \quad \Leftrightarrow \quad \text { image }(R)=\bigcup_{\text {finite }} x y^{*} z
$$

## bwRat versus Fact

Proposition (closure properties)
If $R$ and $S$ belongs to Fact (resp. bwRat), then so do:
$-R \cup S \bullet R \circ S \bullet R^{-1} \bullet \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Sigma} \circ R \vee R \circ \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Delta}$
-R.T $\vee R \cap T \quad$ for $T \in \operatorname{Rec} \quad\left(T=\bigcup_{\text {finite }} X_{i} \times Y_{i}\right)$
Remark

- $|\Sigma|=1 \Rightarrow$ Rat $=$ Fact = bwRat.
$-|\Delta|=1 \Rightarrow$ Rat $=$ Fact $=$ bwRat.


## Question

Do we have Fact = bwRat?

## No.

Theorem
If $R$ is a rational (partial) function then:

$$
R \in \text { bwRat } \quad \Leftrightarrow \quad R \in \text { Fact } \quad \Leftrightarrow \quad \text { image }(R)=\bigcup_{\text {finite }} \widehat{x y^{*} z}
$$

## bwRat versus Fact

Proposition (closure properties)
If $R$ and $S$ belongs to Fact (resp. bwRat), then so do:
$-R \cup S \bullet R \circ S \bullet R^{-1} \bullet \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Sigma} \circ R \vee R \circ \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Delta}$
-R.T $\vee R \cap T \quad$ for $T \in \operatorname{Rec} \quad\left(T=\bigcup_{\text {finite }} X_{i} \times Y_{i}\right)$
Remark

- $|\Sigma|=1 \Rightarrow$ Rat $=$ Fact = bwRat.
$-|\Delta|=1 \Rightarrow$ Rat $=$ Fact $=$ bwRat.


## Question

Do we have Fact = bwRat?

## No.

Theorem
If $R$ is a rational (partial) function then:

$$
\begin{aligned}
R \in \mathrm{bwRat} & \Leftrightarrow \quad R \in \mathrm{Fact} \quad \Leftrightarrow \quad \text { image }(R)=\bigcup_{\text {finite }} \frac{\lambda}{x y^{*} z} \\
& \leftarrow
\end{aligned}
$$

## bwRat versus Fact

Proposition (closure properties)
If $R$ and $S$ belongs to Fact (resp. bwRat), then so do:
$-R \cup S \bullet R \circ S \bullet R^{-1} \bullet \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Sigma} \circ R \vee R \circ \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Delta}$
-R.T $\vee R \cap T \quad$ for $T \in \operatorname{Rec} \quad\left(T=\bigcup_{\text {finite }} X_{i} \times Y_{i}\right)$
Remark

$$
\in \operatorname{Rec}\left(\Sigma^{*}\right) \quad \in \operatorname{Rec}\left(\Delta^{*}\right)
$$

- $|\Sigma|=1 \Rightarrow$ Rat $=$ Fact $=$ bwRat.
$-|\Delta|=1 \Rightarrow$ Rat $=$ Fact $=$ bwRat.


## Question

Do we have Fact = bwRat? No.

Theorem
If $R$ is a rational (partial) function then:

$$
\begin{array}{rll}
R \in \text { bwRat } & \Leftrightarrow \quad R \in \text { Fact } & \Leftrightarrow \\
& \Leftarrow &
\end{array}
$$

Corollary

- Fact $\subseteq$ bwRat


## Proof of $\mathrm{R} \in$ bwRat $\Rightarrow$ image $(\mathrm{R})=\bigcup x y^{*} z$ finite

## Proof of $\mathrm{R} \in$ bwRat $\Rightarrow$ image $(\mathrm{R})=\bigcup_{\text {finite }} x y^{*} z$

Consider the function: $\mathrm{R}^{-1} \circ \mathrm{R} \circ \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Delta}$

## Proof of $\mathrm{R} \in$ bwRat $\Rightarrow$ image $(\mathrm{R})=\bigcup x y^{*} z$ finite

Consider the function: $\mathrm{R}^{-1} \circ \mathrm{R} \circ \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Delta}$


## Proof of $\mathrm{R} \in$ bwRat $\Rightarrow$ image $(\mathrm{R})=\bigcup x y^{*} z$

 finiteConsider the function: $\mathrm{R}^{-1} \circ \mathrm{R} \circ \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Delta}$


## Proof of $\mathrm{R} \in$ bwRat $\Rightarrow$ image $(\mathrm{R})=\bigcup x y^{*} z$

 finiteConsider the function: $\mathrm{R}^{-1} \circ \mathrm{R} \circ \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Delta}$


## Proof of $R \in$ bwRat $\Rightarrow \operatorname{image}(R)=\bigcup x y^{*} z$

Consider the function: $\mathrm{R}^{-1} \circ \mathrm{R} \circ \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Delta}$


## Proof of $\mathrm{R} \in$ bwRat $\Rightarrow$ image $(\mathrm{R})=\bigcup x y^{*} z$

Consider the function: $\mathrm{R}^{-1} \circ \mathrm{R} \circ \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Delta}$ finite


## Proof of $\mathrm{R} \in$ bwRat $\Rightarrow$ image $(\mathrm{R})=\bigcup x y^{*} z$

Consider the function: $\mathrm{R}^{-1} \circ \mathrm{R} \circ \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Delta}$


## Proof of $\mathrm{R} \in$ bwRat $\Rightarrow$ image $(\mathrm{R})=\bigcup x y^{*} z$ finite

Consider the function: $\mathrm{R}^{-1} \circ \mathrm{R} \circ \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Delta}$


## Proof of $\mathrm{R} \in$ bwRat $\Rightarrow$ image $(\mathrm{R})=\bigcup x y^{*} z$ finite

Consider the function: $\mathrm{R}^{-1} \circ \mathrm{R} \circ \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Delta}$

$$
=\{(v, \bar{v}) \mid v \in \operatorname{image}(R)\} \in \operatorname{Rat}
$$



## Proof of $\mathrm{R} \in$ bwRat $\Rightarrow$ image $(\mathrm{R})=\bigcup x y^{*} z$

 finiteConsider the function: $\mathrm{R}^{-1} \circ \mathrm{R} \circ \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Delta}$

$$
=\{(v, \bar{v}) \mid v \in \operatorname{image}(R)\} \in \operatorname{Rat}
$$

$$
\Longrightarrow \text { image }(R)=\bigcup_{\text {finite }} x y^{*} z
$$



## Proof of $\mathrm{R} \in$ bwRat $\Rightarrow$ image $(\mathrm{R})=\bigcup x y^{*} z$

 finiteConsider the function: $\mathrm{R}^{-1} \circ \mathrm{R} \circ \overline{\mathrm{Id}}_{\Delta}$

$$
=\{(v, \bar{v}) \mid v \in \operatorname{image}(R)\} \in \operatorname{Rat}
$$



## Counter example: bwRat $\nsubseteq$ Fact



## Counter example: bwRat $\nsubseteq$ Fact


belongs to Sep if

- $i \neq \ell$
- or $k \neq \ell$
- or $(i=n$ and $j=m)$


## Counter example: bwRat $\nsubseteq$ Fact


belongs to Sep if

- $i \neq \ell$
- or $k \neq \ell$
- or $(i=n$ and $j=m)$


## Counter example: bwRat $\nsubseteq$ Fact


belongs to Sep if

- $i \neq \ell$
- or $k \neq \ell$
- or $(i=n$ and $j=m)$


## Counter example: bwRat $\nsubseteq$ Fact


belongs to Sep if

- $i \neq \ell$
- or $k \neq \ell$
- or $(i=n$ and $j=m)$


## Counter example: bwRat $\nsubseteq$ Fact


belongs to Sep if

- $i \neq \ell$
- or $k \neq \ell$
- or $(i=n$ and $j=m)$


## Counter example: bwRat $\nsubseteq$ Fact


belongs to Sep if

- $i \neq \ell$
- or $k \neq \ell$
- or $(i=n$ and $j=m)$


## Counter example: bwRat $\nsubseteq$ Fact


belongs to Sep if

- $i \neq \ell$
- or $k \neq \ell$
- or $(i=n$ and $j=m)$


## Counter example: bwRat $\nsubseteq$ Fact


belongs to Sep if

- $i \neq \ell$
- or $k \neq \ell$
- or $(i=n$ and $j=m)$
belongs to Sep if and only if
- $i \neq \ell$
- or $k \neq \ell$


## Counter example: bwRat $\nsubseteq$ Fact


belongs to Sep if

- $i \neq \ell$
- or $k \neq \ell$
- or $(i=n$ and $j=m)$
belongs to Sep if and only if
- $i \neq \ell$
- or $k \neq \ell$
- or $(i=n$ and $j=m)$


## Counter example: bwRat $\nsubseteq$ Fact


belongs to Sep if

- $i \neq \ell$
- or $k \neq \ell$
- or $(i=n$ and $j=m)$
belongs to Sep if and only if
- $i \neq \ell$
- or $k \neq \ell$
- or $(k=n$ and $j=m)$


## Counter example: bwRat $\nsubseteq$ Fact


belongs to Sep if

- $i \neq \ell$
- or $k \neq \ell$
- or $(i=n$ and $j=m)$
belongs to Sep if and only if
- $i \neq \ell$
- or $k \neq \ell$
- or $(k=n$ and $j=m)$

Proposition $\quad$ Sep $\in$ bwRat

## Counter example: bwRat $\nsubseteq$ Fact


belongs to Sep if

- $i \neq \ell$
- or $k \neq \ell$
- or $(i=n$ and $j=m)$

Proposition $\quad$ Sep $\in$ bwRat but $\quad$ Sep $\notin$ Fact
belongs to Sep if and only if

- $i \neq \ell$
- or $k \neq \ell$
- or $(k=n$ and $j=m)$


## Conclusion



## Conclusion



## Conclusion



## Conclusion $\quad$ Functional case



## Conclusion $\quad$ Functional case



## Conclusion $\quad$ Functional case



Thanks for your attention. 13/13

